EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OF RHODE ISLAND ACTUARIAL EXPERIENCE STUDY
FOR THE SIX-YEAR PERIOD ENDING JUNE 30, 2010
SUPPLEMENT COVERING THE MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM (MERS)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section I Introduction ..... 2
Section II Analysis of Experience and Recommendations ..... 4
Section III Actuarial Impact of Recommendations ..... 8
Section IV Summary of Assumptions and Methods Incorporating the Recommended Assumptions ..... 10
Section V Summary of Data and Experience. ..... 21

## SECTION I

INTRODUCTION

## Section I <br> Introduction

This Supplement is considered part of the Experience Study prepared for ERSRI and to be read in conjunction with the main report covering ERSRI (State Employees and Teachers). It includes a review of our analysis for most of the actuarial assumptions and methods for the Municipal Employees' Retirement System (MERS). However, this Supplement is not as comprehensive as the main report. Some of the actuarial assumptions, for example, price inflation and investment return assumption are set once for all of the plans, and these are not discussed here. Some of the detailed analysis in the main report is not repeated here.

## Organization of Report

Section II contains our findings and recommendations for actuarial assumptions specific to MERS. The impact of adopting our recommendations on liabilities and contribution rates is shown in Section III. Section IV presents a summary of all the actuarial assumptions and methods, including the recommended changes. Finally, tables summarizing the analysis of the assumptions are in Section V.

## SECTION II

ANALYSIS OF EXPERIENCE AND RECOMMENDATIONS

## Section II <br> Analysis of Experience and Recommendations

## Inflation rate

We recommend using the same $2.75 \%$ assumption recommended for ERSRI.

## Investment return rate

We recommend using the same $7.50 \%$ assumption recommended for ERSRI.

## Salary increase rates

As with ERSRI, the salary assumption consists of two pieces

1. The wage inflation assumption for long-service employees
2. The service-related schedule added to wage inflation for shorter-service employees

The next two subsections will discuss these components of the salary assumption.

## Salary increase assumptions for long-service employees (wage inflation)

For general MERS employees, we currently assume a $4.50 \%$ rate for wage inflation ( $3.00 \%$ price inflation, plus $1.50 \%$ productivity). For the police and fire units, we assume wage inflation of $4.75 \%$ ( $3.00 \%$ price inflation plus $1.75 \%$ productivity).

The analysis we carried out shows that after the step rate period, salary increases leveled off at about $3.7 \%$ for general employees and at about $4.0 \%$ for police and fire employees. During the study period, price inflation averaged about $2.4 \%$ per year. Therefore, actual productivity increases were about $1.3 \%$ for general employees and about $1.6 \%$ for police/fire employees. Consistent with the recommended changes for ERSRI, we have recommended a decrease in the productivity component by $0.50 \%$ for both groups. This, combined with the lower inflation assumption, produce long term salary assumptions of $4.00 \%$ for general employees and $4.25 \%$ for police and fire units.

## Salary increase assumptions for shorter-service employees

For general employees, we had been adding a service-related increase only for members with less than ten years of service and the analysis showed this should be extended to fifteen years. In addition, the analysis for both groups showed that the current service-related increases were reasonable and only minor tweaks were needed. The analyses of the service-related increases are shown on pages 33-34 and the new assumptions are shown on pages 13-14.

## Payroll growth rate

We are recommending decreasing the payroll growth rate from $4.25 \%$ to $3.75 \%$, just as we did for ERSRI.

## Analysis of Experience and Recommendations - Continued

## Post-retirement mortality rates (non-disabled)

We currently use the same mortality assumption for MERS retirees that we use for state employees and are recommending the same changes for MERS that were recommended for ERSRI.

## Disabled mortality rates

All of the ERSRI plans use the same disabled mortality tables. The analysis of this assumption was discussed in the ERSRI report.

## Active mortality rates

Like the post-retirement mortality rates, this assumption is the same for state employees and MERS employees, and the groups were combined for our analysis.

## Disability rates

We analyzed disability separately for males and females, for general employees and police/fire employees, and for ordinary and accidental disability.

For general employees, the analysis shows a reasonably close match between the current assumption and experience. Therefore, we are recommending only a slight decrease in the accidental disability rates for females. The other disability incidence assumptions will remain unchanged.

For police and fire employees our current assumptions are unisex, i.e., the same rates are used for males and females. For ordinary disability, we are recommending no change from the current assumption. For accidental disability, there were fewer disabilities than expected. Therefore, we are recommending lowering the rates of accidental disability slightly.

Details of the analysis are shown on pages 24-29. The recommended new assumptions are on page 16.

## Retirement rates

The retirement rates are only applied to members eligible for retirement. Separate assumptions are set for general employees and for police/fire employees. The police/fire units which have elected the 20-year retirement option have a different retirement assumption than the other police/fire employees.

For general employees we follow the same approach we use for ERSRI, splitting the retirement rates into one service-based table, for members who reach 30 years of service before age 58, and a second age-based table for all others. We assume general employees retire by age 70.

For this assumption, an A/E ratio between $90 \%$ and $100 \%$ is desirable for conservatism. For general employees who reach 30 years of service before age 58, the experience showed more retirements than expected, with A/E ratios of $113 \%$ for males and $111 \%$ for females. For members who reach

## Analysis of Experience and Recommendations - Continued

age 58 first, the opposite was true and there were fewer retirements than expected, with $\mathrm{A} / \mathrm{E}$ ratios of $68 \%$ for males and $89 \%$ for females.

Therefore, we have made appropriate adjustments for the two groups of assumptions, with the net impact pretty much an offset to each other. The proposed retirement rates for general employees are shown on page 18 and the analysis is shown on pages 35-36 and 38-39.

For police and fire, we have assumption based on years of service, and the experience showed more retirements than the current assumption expected. We have made adjustments accordingly.

Section VI, provides the proposed police/fire retirement rates are shown in Section VI, on page 19, and the analysis is shown on pages 37 .

## Termination rates

Separate termination rates are used for general employees and police/fire, and separate assumptions are used for males and females. As with ERSRI, we currently use termination rates that are a function of service.

The current assumptions were reasonable for all groups. We have made slight adjustments at specific levels of service for general employees, but made no adjustments for police and fire.

The actual new rates are show on pages 17. Details of the analysis are shown on the tables at pages 30-32.

## Marriage Assumption

We are recommending no change to the percentage of members assumed to be married at death from $85 \%$, just as we did for ERSRI.

## Other assumptions

There are other technical and minor assumptions made in the course of a valuation, such as the timing of terminations and retirements during the year, and the timing of salary increases. We reviewed these and are recommending no changes.

## Actuarial cost method

We continue to believe the individual Entry Age Normal cost method (EAN) is appropriate, and we are recommending no change.

## Actuarial Value of Assets

The method used to determine the actuarial asset value for MERS is the same one used for ERSRI (i.e. a 5-year smoothing method without corridor).

## SECTION III

## ACTUARIAL IMPACT OF RECOMMENDATIONS

## Section III Impact of Proposed Changes to Actuarial Assumptions

It is beyond the scope of this report to provide the detailed effect of the recommended assumptions on each MERS unit. However, we do provide below some summary information.

Please note the following information is based on draft results as all of the detailed results for each unit had not been finalized as of the publication of this report. Even though the actual number for individual units may change as the results of the June 30, 2010 valuation are finalized, the following results are a good representation of the magnitude of the changes from the recommended assumptions.

| Item | Before <br> Assumption <br> Changes | After <br> Assumption <br> Changes |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Average normal cost (pct. of salary) | $14.86 \%$ | $17.70 \%$ |
| Unfunded actuarial accrued liability (UAAL, millions) | $\$ 237.2$ | $\$ 430.6$ |
| Funded ratio | $83.4 \%$ | $73.5 \%$ |
| Weighted average contribution rate | $13.43 \%$ | $21.76 \%$ |
| Total FY 2013 contributions (millions) | $\$ 41.1$ | $\$ 66.6$ |

As shown, the changes in the assumptions will result in a substantial increase in the actuarial accrued liability (and UAAL) and employer contribution rates.

We believe the Board's decision about whether or not to adopt our recommendations should be based on the appropriateness of each recommendation individually, not on their collective effect on the contribution rate or the actuarial liabilities.

## SECTION IV <br> SUMMARY OF ASSUMPTIONS AND METHODS <br> INCORPORATING THE RECOMMENDED <br> ASSUMPTIONS

## State of Rhode Island

## Section IV Summary of Assumptions and Methods Incorporating the Recommended Assumptions

I. Valuation Date

The valuation date is June 30th of each plan year. This is the date as of which the actuarial present value of future benefits and the actuarial value of assets are determined.

## II. Actuarial Cost Method

The actuarial valuation uses the Entry Age Normal (EAN) actuarial cost method. Under this method, the employer contribution rate is the sum of (i) the employer normal cost rate, and (ii) a rate that will amortize the unfunded actuarial accrued liability (UAAL).

The employer normal cost rate is the total normal cost rate, less the member contribution rate. The total normal cost rate is the level percentage-of-pay contribution which would theoretically pay for all benefits if it had been made each year from the inception of the plan and if there had never been any changes of benefits, any changes of assumptions or methods, or any experience gains or losses. The normal costs are determined on an individual basis.

The actuarial accrued liability is the difference between the actuarial present value of all future benefits and the actuarial present value of future normal costs. It is the amount to which the normal costs would have accumulated under the assumptions described in the preceding paragraph. The unfunded actuarial accrued liability (UAAL) is the difference between the actuarial accrued liability and the actuarial value of assets.

The amortization contribution rate is the level percentage of payroll required to reduce the UAAL to zero over the remaining amortization period. The UAAL is being amortized over the remainder of a closed 30-year period from June 30, 1999. The employer contribution rate determined by this valuation will not be effective until two years after the valuation date. The determination of the contribution rate reflects this deferral. The unfunded actuarial accrued liability (UAAL) and covered payroll are projected forward for two years, and we then determine the amortization charge required to amortize the UAAL over the remaining amortization period from that point. In projecting the UAAL, we increase the UAAL for interest at the assumed rate and we decrease it for the amortization payments. The amortization payments for these two years are determined by subtracting the current employer normal cost from the known contribution rates for these years, based on the two prior actuarial valuations. Contributions are assumed to be made monthly throughout the year.

## Summary of Assumptions and Methods - Continued

## III. Actuarial Value of Assets

The actuarial value of assets is based on the market value of assets with a five-year phasein of actual investment return in excess of (less than) expected investment income.
Expected investment income is determined using the assumed investment return rate and the market value of assets (adjusted for receipts and disbursements during the year). The returns are computed net of administrative and investment expenses. The actuarial value is calculated in the aggregate for all units combined, and then it is allocated to each unit in ratio to that unit's market value.

## IV. Actuarial Assumptions

## A. Economic Assumptions

1. Investment return: $7.50 \%$ per year, compounded annually, composed of an assumed $2.75 \%$ inflation rate and a $4.75 \%$ net real rate of return. This rate represents the assumed return, net of all investment and administrative expenses.
2. Salary increase rate: For general employees, the sum of (i) a $4.00 \%$ wage inflation assumption (composed of a $2.75 \%$ price inflation assumption and a $1.25 \%$ additional general increase), and (ii) a service-related component as shown below:

| General Employees |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Years of <br> Service | Service-Related <br> Component |  |
| 0 | $4.00 \%$ |  |
| Total Increase |  |  |
| 1 | 3.00 |  |
| 2 | 2.75 |  |
| $3.00 \%$ |  |  |
| 3 | 2.50 |  |
| 7.00 |  |  |
| 5 | 2.25 |  |
| 6.75 |  |  |
| 6 | 2.00 |  |
| 1.25 | 6.50 |  |
| $8-9$ | 0.75 |  |
| $10-14$ | 0.50 |  |
| 0.25 | 6.25 |  |
| 15 or more | 0.00 |  |

For police/fire employees, the sum of (i) a $4.25 \%$ wage inflation assumption (composed of a $2.75 \%$ price inflation assumption and a $1.50 \%$ additional general increase), and (ii) a service-related component as shown below:

| Police/Fire Employees |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Years of | Service-Related <br> Component | Total Increase |
| 0 | $10.00 \%$ | $14.25 \%$ |
| 1 | 9.00 | 13.25 |
| 2 | 6.00 | 10.25 |
| 3 | 3.00 | 7.25 |
| 4 | 2.50 | 6.75 |
| 5 | 2.00 | 6.25 |
| 6 | 0.50 | 4.75 |
| 7 | 0.50 | 4.75 |
| 8 | 0.25 | 4.50 |
| 9 | 0.25 | 4.50 |
| 10 or more | 0.00 | 4.25 |

Salary increases are assumed to occur once a year, on July 1. Therefore the pay used for the year following the valuation date is equal to the reported pay for the prior year, increased by the salary increase assumption. For employees with less than one year of service, the reported rate of pay is used rather than the fiscal year salary paid.
3. Payroll growth rate: In the amortization of the unfunded actuarial accrued liability, payroll is assumed to increase $3.75 \%$ per year. This increase rate is solely due to the effect of wage inflation on salaries, with no allowance for future membership growth.
B. Demographic Assumptions

1. Post-retirement mortality rates:
a. Male employees: $115 \%$ of the RP-2000 Combined Healthy for Males with White Collar adjustments, projected with Scale AA.
b. Female employees: $95 \%$ of the RP-2000 Combined Healthy for Females with White Collar adjustments, projected with Scale AA.
c. Disabled males $-60 \%$ of the PBGC Table Va for disabled males eligible for Social Security disability benefits
d. Disabled females $-60 \%$ of the PBGC Table VIa for disabled females eligible for Social Security disability benefits.
2. Pre-retirement mortality (combined ordinary and duty):
a. Male employees: 75\% of RP-2000 Combined Healthy for Males with White Collar adjustments.
b. Female employees: 75\% of RP-2000 Combined Healthy for Females with White Collar adjustments.

Sample rates are shown below:

| Number of Deaths per 100 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Age | Males |  |
| 25 | 0.03 |  |
| 30 | 0.03 |  |
| 35 | 0.04 |  |
| 40 | 0.07 |  |
| 45 | 0.10 |  |
| 50 | 0.15 |  |
| 55 | 0.25 |  |
| 60 | 0.42 |  |
| 65 | 0.83 |  |
| 70 | 1.45 |  |

3. Disability rates: Sample rates (per 100) are shown below. Ordinary disability rates are not applied to members eligible for retirement.

| Age | General <br> Employees, <br> Ordinary, <br> Males | General <br> Employees, <br> Accidental, <br> Males | General <br> Employees, <br> Ordinary, <br> Females | General <br> Employees, <br> Accidental, <br> Females |  <br> Fire, <br> Ordinary, <br> Males and <br> Females |  <br> Fire, <br> Accidental, <br> Males and <br> Females |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 25 | 0.63 | 0.23 | 0.27 | 0.08 | 0.43 | 2.55 |
| 30 | 0.77 | 0.28 | 0.33 | 0.09 | 0.55 | 3.30 |
| 35 | 1.05 | 0.38 | 0.45 | 0.12 | 0.73 | 4.35 |
| 40 | 1.54 | 0.55 | 0.66 | 0.18 | 1.10 | 6.60 |
| 45 | 2.52 | 0.90 | 1.08 | 0.29 | 1.80 | 10.80 |
| 50 | 4.27 | 1.53 | 1.83 | 0.49 | 3.03 | 18.15 |
| 55 | 7.07 | 2.53 | 3.03 | 0.81 | 3.03 | 18.15 |
| 60 | 9.87 | 3.53 | 4.23 | 1.13 | 3.03 | 18.15 |
| 65 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 3.03 | 18.15 |

4. Termination rates (for causes other than death, disability, or retirement) are a function of the member's service. Termination rates are not applied to members eligible for retirement. Rates are shown below:

| Service | Male <br> General Employees | Female General Employee | Police \& Fire, Males \& Females |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | 0.1750 | 0.1800 | 0.1000 |
| 1 | 0.1087 | 0.1143 | 0.0528 |
| 2 | 0.0922 | 0.0973 | 0.0481 |
| 3 | 0.0778 | 0.0824 | 0.0436 |
| 4 | 0.0655 | 0.0695 | 0.0394 |
| 5 | 0.0552 | 0.0584 | 0.0354 |
| 6 | 0.0465 | 0.0491 | 0.0316 |
| 7 | 0.0394 | 0.0412 | 0.0281 |
| 8 | 0.0337 | 0.0348 | 0.0249 |
| 9 | 0.0293 | 0.0296 | 0.0219 |
| 10 | 0.0260 | 0.0255 | 0.0191 |
| 11 | 0.0236 | 0.0223 | 0.0166 |
| 12 | 0.0220 | 0.0199 | 0.0143 |
| 13 | 0.0209 | 0.0181 | 0.0123 |
| 14 | 0.0204 | 0.0169 | 0.0105 |
| 15 | 0.0201 | 0.0159 | 0.0090 |
| 16 | 0.0200 | 0.0152 | 0.0077 |
| 17 | 0.0198 | 0.0145 | 0.0067 |
| 18 | 0.0195 | 0.0137 | 0.0059 |
| 19 | 0.0187 | 0.0127 | 0.0000 |
| 20 | 0.0175 | 0.0112 | 0.0000 |
| 21 | 0.0156 | 0.0092 | 0.0000 |
| 22 | 0.0129 | 0.0065 | 0.0000 |
| 23 | 0.0092 | 0.0030 | 0.0000 |
| 24 | 0.0044 | 0.0000 | 0.0000 |

5. Retirement Rates: Separate male and female rates for general employees. For members who reach 30 years of service before age 58, service-based rates are used. For other members, age-based rates are used.

| General Employees |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Males |  |  |  | Females |  |  |  |
| Service (00/30) |  | Age (58/10) |  | Service (00/30) |  | Age (58/10) |  |
| Service | Ret. Rate | Age | Ret. Rate | Service | Ret. Rate | Age | Ret. Rate |
| 30 | 30.0\% | 58 | 12.0\% | 30 | 30.0\% | 58 | 12.0\% |
| 31 | 30.0\% | 59 | 10.0\% | 31 | 25.0\% | 59 | 10.0\% |
| 32 | 25.0\% | 60 | 10.0\% | 32 | 10.0\% | 60 | 10.0\% |
| 33 | 25.0\% | 61 | 10.0\% | 33 | 10.0\% | 61 | 10.0\% |
| 34 | 25.0\% | 62 | 30.0\% | 34 | 10.0\% | 62 | 20.0\% |
| 35 | 25.0\% | 63 | 20.0\% | 35 | 15.0\% | 63 | 15.0\% |
| 36 | 25.0\% | 64 | 20.0\% | 36 | 20.0\% | 64 | 15.0\% |
| 37 | 25.0\% | 65 | 20.0\% | 37 | 25.0\% | 65 | 20.0\% |
| 38 | 35.0\% | 66 | 25.0\% | 38 | 25.0\% | 66 | 25.0\% |
| 39 | 50.0\% | 67 | 25.0\% | 39 | 25.0\% | 67 | 25.0\% |
| 40 | 100.0\% | 68 | 25.0\% | 40 | 100.0\% | 68 | 25.0\% |
|  |  | 69 | 30.0\% |  |  | 69 | 25.0\% |
|  |  | 70 | 30.0\% |  |  | 70 | 20.0\% |
|  |  | 71 | 30.0\% |  |  | 71 | 20.0\% |
|  |  | 72 | 30.0\% |  |  | 72 | 20.0\% |
|  |  | 73 | 30.0\% |  |  | 73 | 20.0\% |
|  |  | 74 | 30.0\% |  |  | 74 | 20.0\% |
|  |  | 75 | 100.0\% |  |  | 75 | 100.0\% |

5. Retirement Rates (continued): Unisex, service based rates are used for police and fire. Rates depend on whether the unit has elected the optional 20 -year retirement provisions. All members are assumed to retire upon reaching age 65 with at least ten years of service.

| Police and Fire |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Service | Units with the <br> Optional 20-year <br> retirement election |  |
| 20 | $12.0 \%$ |  |
| Units without the <br> Optional 20-year <br> retirement election |  |  |
| 21 | $10.0 \%$ |  |
| 22 | $10.0 \%$ |  |
| 23 | $10.0 \%$ |  |
| 24 | $12.0 \%$ |  |
| 25 | $14.0 \%$ |  |
| 26 | $16.0 \%$ |  |
| 27 | $18.0 \%$ |  |
| $20.0 \%$ | $50.0 \%$ |  |
| 29 | $20.0 \%$ |  |
| $30+$ | $35.0 \%$ |  |

## State of Rhode Island

Actuarial Valuation - June 30, 2005
C. Other Assumptions

1. Percent married: $85 \%$ of employees are assumed to be married.
2. Age difference: Male members are assumed to be three years older than their spouses, and female members are assumed to be three years younger than their spouses.
3. Percent electing annuity on death (when eligible): All of the spouses of vested, married participants are assumed to elect an annuity.
4. Percent electing deferred termination benefit: Vested terminating members are assumed to elect a refund or a deferred benefit, whichever is more valuable at the time of termination.
5. Recovery from disability: None assumed.
6. Remarriage: It is assumed that no surviving spouse will remarry and there will be no children's benefit.
7. Assumed age for commencement of deferred benefits: Members electing to receive a deferred benefit are assumed to commence receipt at the first age at which unreduced benefits are available.
8. Investment and administrative expenses: The assumed investment return rate represents the anticipated net return after payment of all investment and administrative expenses.
9. Inactive members: Liabilities for inactive members are approximated as a multiple of their member contribution account balances. For nonvested inactive members, the multiple is 1.0. For vested inactive members, the multiple is 8.0 for members with 25 or more years of service, 3.0 for members age 45 or older, and 1.0 for other vested members younger than age 45 .
10. Decrement timing: For all members, decrements are assumed to occur at the middle of the year.

## Summary of Assumptions and Methods - Continued

## V. Participant Data

Participant data was supplied on electronic files. There were separate files for (i) active and inactive members, and (ii) members and beneficiaries receiving benefits.

The data for an active members included birthdate, sex, service, salary and employee contribution account balance. For retired members and beneficiaries, the data included date of birth, sex, spouse's date of birth (where applicable), amount of monthly benefit, date of retirement, and a form of payment code.

Salary supplied for the current year was based on the earnings for the year preceding the valuation date. This salary was adjusted by the salary increase rate for one year. However, for members with less than one year of service, the current rate of salary was used. This salary was adjusted by the salary increase rate for one year.

Assumptions were made for missing or inconsistent data, as warranted. These had no material impact on the results presented.

## SECTION V <br> SUMMARY OF DATA AND EXPERIENCE

## List of Tables

Disability experience for male general employees (ordinary disability) ..... 23
Disability experience for female general employees (ordinary disability) ..... 24
Disability experience for police/fire employees (ordinary disability) ..... 25
Disability experience for male general employees (accidental disability) ..... 26
Disability experience for female general employees (accidental disability) ..... 27
Disability experience for police/fire employees (accidental disability) ..... 28
Termination experience for male general employees ..... 29
Termination experience for female general employees ..... 30
Termination experience for police/fire employees ..... 31
Salary experience for general employees ..... 32
Salary experience for police/fire employees ..... 33
Service based retirement experience for male general employees ..... 34
Service based retirement experience for female general employees ..... 35
Service based retirement experience for police/fire employees ..... 36
Age based retirement experience for male general employees ..... 37
Age based retirement experience for female general employees ..... 38

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

MALE ORDINARY DISABILITY EXPERIENCE

| Age | Actual <br> Retirement | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { Current (3) } \\ & \quad *(5) \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | Proposed <br> (3) * (6) | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| Under 20 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 20-24 | - | 9 | 0.0000 | 0.0005 | 0.0005 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 25-29 | - | 187 | 0.0000 | 0.0007 | 0.0007 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 30-34 | - | 379 | 0.0000 | 0.0009 | 0.0009 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 35-39 | - | 900 | 0.0000 | 0.0012 | 0.0012 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 40-44 | 1 | 1,764 | 0.0006 | 0.0019 | 0.0019 | 3 | 3 | 33\% | 33\% |
| 45-49 | 4 | 2,231 | 0.0018 | 0.0032 | 0.0032 | 7 | 7 | 57\% | 57\% |
| 50-54 | 16 | 2,593 | 0.0062 | 0.0054 | 0.0054 | 14 | 14 | 114\% | 114\% |
| 55-59 | 8 | 1,441 | 0.0056 | 0.0082 | 0.0082 | 11 | 11 | 73\% | 73\% |
| 60-64 | 2 | 229 | 0.0087 | 0.0111 | 0.0111 | 2 | 2 | 100\% | 100\% |
| 65-69 | 1 | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 70-74 | 1 | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 75 and over | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Totals | 33 | 9,733 |  |  |  | 38 | 38 | 87\% | 87\% |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

FEMALE ORDINARY DISABILITY EXPERIENCE

| Age | Actual <br> Retirement | Total <br> Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (3) } \\ \quad *(5) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(3) *(6)$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| Under 20 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 20-24 | - | 6 | 0.0000 | 0.0002 | 0.0002 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 25-29 | - | 84 | 0.0000 | 0.0003 | 0.0003 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 30-34 | - | 347 | 0.0000 | 0.0004 | 0.0004 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 35-39 | 1 | 821 | 0.0012 | 0.0005 | 0.0005 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 40-44 | 3 | 1,842 | 0.0016 | 0.0008 | 0.0008 | 2 | 2 | 150\% | 150\% |
| 45-49 | 3 | 3,319 | 0.0009 | 0.0014 | 0.0014 | 5 | 5 | 60\% | 60\% |
| 50-54 | 5 | 4,588 | 0.0011 | 0.0023 | 0.0023 | 11 | 11 | 45\% | 45\% |
| 55-59 | 7 | 2,590 | 0.0027 | 0.0035 | 0.0035 | 9 | 9 | 78\% | 78\% |
| 60-64 | 3 | 319 | 0.0094 | 0.0048 | 0.0048 | 1 | 1 | 300\% | 300\% |
| 65-69 | 1 | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 70-74 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 75 and over | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Totals | 23 | 13,916 |  |  |  | 28 | 28 | 82\% | 82\% |

## POLICE AND FIREFIGHTERS

MALE ORDINARY DISABILITY EXPERIENCE

| Age | Actual <br> Disabilities | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Disabilities |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| Under 20 | - | - | N/A | 0.0003 | 0.0003 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 20-24 | - | 4 | 0.0000 | 0.0003 | 0.0003 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 25-29 | - | 236 | 0.0000 | 0.0005 | 0.0005 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 30-34 | - | 830 | 0.0000 | 0.0006 | 0.0006 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 35-39 | 1 | 1,464 | 0.0007 | 0.0009 | 0.0009 | 1 | 1 | 100\% | 100\% |
| 40-44 | 1 | 1,776 | 0.0006 | 0.0014 | 0.0014 | 2 | 2 | 50\% | 50\% |
| 45-49 | 1 | 1,082 | 0.0009 | 0.0023 | 0.0023 | 2 | 2 | 50\% | 50\% |
| 50-54 | 1 | 142 | 0.0070 | 0.0030 | 0.0030 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 55-59 | - | - | N/A | 0.0030 | 0.0030 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 60-64 | - | - | N/A | 0.0030 | 0.0030 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 65-69 | - | - | N/A | 0.0030 | 0.0030 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 70-74 | - | - | N/A | 0.0030 | 0.0030 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 75 and over | - | - | N/A | 0.0030 | 0.0030 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Totals | 4 | 5,534 |  |  |  | 6 | 6 | 67\% | 67\% |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES MALE DUTY DISABILITY EXPERIENCE

| Age | Actual Retirement | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \text { Current (3) } \\ *(5) \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(3) *(6)$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| Under 20 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 20-24 | - | 112 | 0.0000 | 0.0002 | 0.0002 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 25-29 | - | 453 | 0.0000 | 0.0003 | 0.0002 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 30-34 | - | 617 | 0.0000 | 0.0004 | 0.0003 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 35-39 | - | 1,262 | 0.0000 | 0.0005 | 0.0004 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 40-44 | 1 | 2,212 | 0.0005 | 0.0008 | 0.0007 | 2 | 2 | 50\% | 50\% |
| 45-49 | 2 | 2,738 | 0.0007 | 0.0014 | 0.0012 | 4 | 3 | 50\% | 67\% |
| 50-54 | 2 | 4,742 | 0.0004 | 0.0023 | 0.0019 | 10 | 9 | 20\% | 22\% |
| 55-59 | 9 | 2,528 | 0.0036 | 0.0035 | 0.0029 | 9 | 7 | 100\% | 129\% |
| 60-64 | 1 | 1,048 | 0.0010 | 0.0048 | 0.0040 | 5 | 4 | 20\% | 25\% |
| 65-69 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 70-74 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 75 and over | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Totals | 15 | 15,712 |  |  |  | 31 | 26 | 48\% | 58\% |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

 FEMALE DUTY DISABILITY EXPERIENCE| Age | Actual <br> Retirement | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (3) } \\ \quad *(5) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(3) *(6)$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| Under 20 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 20-24 | - | 72 | 0.0000 | 0.0001 | 0.0001 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 25-29 | - | 318 | 0.0000 | 0.0001 | 0.0001 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 30-34 | - | 649 | 0.0000 | 0.0001 | 0.0001 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 35-39 | - | 1,285 | 0.0000 | 0.0002 | 0.0001 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 40-44 | - | 2,771 | 0.0000 | 0.0003 | 0.0002 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 45-49 | 1 | 4,306 | 0.0002 | 0.0005 | 0.0004 | 2 | 2 | 50\% | 50\% |
| 50-54 | 1 | 6,862 | 0.0001 | 0.0008 | 0.0006 | 5 | 4 | 20\% | 25\% |
| 55-59 | 2 | 4,170 | 0.0005 | 0.0012 | 0.0009 | 5 | 4 | 40\% | 50\% |
| 60-64 | 2 | 1,774 | 0.0011 | 0.0016 | 0.0013 | 3 | 2 | 67\% | 100\% |
| 65-69 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 70-74 | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 75 and over | - | - | N/A | 0.0000 | 0.0000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Totals | 6 | 22,207 |  |  |  | 16 | 13 | 38\% | 46\% |

## POLICE AND FIREFIGHTERS DUTY DISABILITY EXPERIENCE

| Age | Actual <br> Disabilities | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Disabilities |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed (2) / (8) |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| Under 20 | - | 1 | 0.0000 | 0.0021 | 0.0018 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 20-24 | - | 115 | 0.0000 | 0.0024 | 0.0021 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 25-29 | 1 | 685 | 0.0015 | 0.0033 | 0.0029 | 2 | 2 | 50\% | 50\% |
| 30-34 | 1 | 1,121 | 0.0009 | 0.0043 | 0.0037 | 5 | 4 | 20\% | 25\% |
| 35-39 | 8 | 1,951 | 0.0041 | 0.0061 | 0.0053 | 12 | 11 | 67\% | 73\% |
| 40-44 | 13 | 2,228 | 0.0058 | 0.0097 | 0.0083 | 21 | 18 | 62\% | 72\% |
| 45-49 | 10 | 1,128 | 0.0089 | 0.0160 | 0.0137 | 18 | 15 | 56\% | 67\% |
| 50-54 | 6 | 145 | 0.0414 | 0.0212 | 0.0181 | 3 | 3 | 200\% | 200\% |
| 55-59 | 3 | - | N/A | 0.0212 | 0.0181 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 60-64 | - | - | N/A | 0.0212 | 0.0181 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 65-69 | - | - | N/A | 0.0212 | 0.0181 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 70-74 | - | - | N/A | 0.0212 | 0.0181 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 75 and over | - | - | N/A | 0.0212 | 0.0181 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Totals | 42 | 7,374 |  |  |  | 61 | 53 | 69\% | 79\% |

GENERAL EMPLOYEES
SERVICE BASED WITHDRAWAL EXPERIENCE - MALE

| Service | Actual <br> Withdrawal | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Withdrawal |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed <br> (2) / (8) |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 1 | 237 | 1,290 | 0.1837 | 0.1750 | 0.1750 | 226 | 226 | 105\% | 105\% |
| 2 | 233 | 1,889 | 0.1233 | 0.0959 | 0.1087 | 181 | 205 | 129\% | 114\% |
| 3 | 152 | 1,825 | 0.0833 | 0.0825 | 0.0922 | 151 | 168 | 101\% | 90\% |
| 4 | 118 | 1,690 | 0.0698 | 0.0713 | 0.0778 | 120 | 132 | 98\% | 89\% |
| 5 | 103 | 1,504 | 0.0685 | 0.0618 | 0.0655 | 93 | 99 | 111\% | 104\% |
| 6 | 64 | 1,344 | 0.0476 | 0.0541 | 0.0552 | 73 | 74 | 88\% | 86\% |
| 7 | 53 | 1,278 | 0.0415 | 0.0480 | 0.0465 | 61 | 59 | 87\% | 90\% |
| 8 | 51 | 1,180 | 0.0432 | 0.0431 | 0.0394 | 51 | 46 | 100\% | 111\% |
| 9 | 43 | 1,084 | 0.0397 | 0.0395 | 0.0337 | 43 | 37 | 100\% | 116\% |
| 10 | 22 | 994 | 0.0221 | 0.0368 | 0.0293 | 37 | 29 | 59\% | 76\% |
| 11 | 31 | 976 | 0.0318 | 0.0350 | 0.0260 | 34 | 25 | 91\% | 124\% |
| 12 | 21 | 901 | 0.0233 | 0.0338 | 0.0236 | 30 | 21 | 70\% | 100\% |
| 13 | 18 | 874 | 0.0206 | 0.0330 | 0.0220 | 29 | 19 | 62\% | 95\% |
| 14 | 28 | 866 | 0.0323 | 0.0326 | 0.0209 | 28 | 18 | 100\% | 156\% |
| 15 | 19 | 810 | 0.0235 | 0.0323 | 0.0204 | 26 | 17 | 73\% | 112\% |
| 16 | 16 | 768 | 0.0208 | 0.0319 | 0.0201 | 24 | 15 | 67\% | 107\% |
| 17 | 17 | 718 | 0.0237 | 0.0312 | 0.0200 | 22 | 14 | 77\% | 121\% |
| 18 | 11 | 660 | 0.0167 | 0.0302 | 0.0198 | 20 | 13 | 55\% | 85\% |
| 19 | 10 | 604 | 0.0166 | 0.0285 | 0.0195 | 17 | 12 | 59\% | 83\% |
| 20 | 10 | 552 | 0.0181 | 0.0261 | 0.0187 | 14 | 10 | 71\% | 100\% |
| 21 | 3 | 492 | 0.0061 | 0.0227 | 0.0175 | 11 | 9 | 27\% | 33\% |
| 22 | 5 | 417 | 0.0120 | 0.0182 | 0.0156 | 8 | 7 | 63\% | 71\% |
| 23 | 6 | 364 | 0.0165 | 0.0124 | 0.0129 | 5 | 5 | 120\% | 120\% |
| 24 | 5 | 329 | 0.0152 | 0.0052 | 0.0092 | 2 | 3 | 250\% | 167\% |
| 25 | 2 | 300 | 0.0067 | 0.0052 | 0.0044 | 2 | 1 | 100\% | 200\% |
| Totals | 1,278 | 23,709 |  |  |  | 1,308 | 1,264 | 98\% | 101\% |

GENERAL EMPLOYEES
SERVICE BASED WITHDRAWAL EXPERIENCE - FEMALE

| Service | Actual <br> Withdrawal | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Withdrawal |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed <br> (2) / (8) |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 1 | 250 | 1,384 | 0.1806 | 0.1800 | 0.1800 | 249 | 249 | 100\% | 100\% |
| 2 | 298 | 2,459 | 0.1212 | 0.1069 | 0.1143 | 263 | 281 | 113\% | 106\% |
| 3 | 224 | 2,494 | 0.0898 | 0.0906 | 0.0973 | 226 | 243 | 99\% | 92\% |
| 4 | 202 | 2,447 | 0.0826 | 0.0769 | 0.0824 | 188 | 202 | 107\% | 100\% |
| 5 | 162 | 2,300 | 0.0704 | 0.0653 | 0.0695 | 150 | 160 | 108\% | 101\% |
| 6 | 117 | 2,148 | 0.0545 | 0.0558 | 0.0584 | 120 | 126 | 98\% | 93\% |
| 7 | 105 | 2,051 | 0.0512 | 0.0481 | 0.0491 | 99 | 101 | 106\% | 104\% |
| 8 | 78 | 1,928 | 0.0405 | 0.0420 | 0.0412 | 81 | 79 | 96\% | 98\% |
| 9 | 58 | 1,755 | 0.0330 | 0.0374 | 0.0348 | 66 | 61 | 88\% | 95\% |
| 10 | 41 | 1,583 | 0.0259 | 0.0341 | 0.0296 | 54 | 47 | 76\% | 88\% |
| 11 | 45 | 1,445 | 0.0311 | 0.0318 | 0.0255 | 46 | 37 | 98\% | 122\% |
| 12 | 33 | 1,340 | 0.0246 | 0.0304 | 0.0223 | 41 | 30 | 80\% | 111\% |
| 13 | 26 | 1,297 | 0.0200 | 0.0297 | 0.0199 | 39 | 26 | 67\% | 101\% |
| 14 | 26 | 1,257 | 0.0207 | 0.0295 | 0.0181 | 37 | 23 | 70\% | 114\% |
| 15 | 19 | 1,217 | 0.0156 | 0.0295 | 0.0169 | 36 | 21 | 53\% | 93\% |
| 16 | 15 | 1,160 | 0.0129 | 0.0297 | 0.0159 | 34 | 18 | 44\% | 81\% |
| 17 | 22 | 1,067 | 0.0206 | 0.0297 | 0.0152 | 32 | 16 | 69\% | 135\% |
| 18 | 14 | 956 | 0.0146 | 0.0295 | 0.0145 | 28 | 14 | 50\% | 101\% |
| 19 | 6 | 857 | 0.0070 | 0.0287 | 0.0137 | 25 | 12 | 24\% | 51\% |
| 20 | 9 | 753 | 0.0120 | 0.0273 | 0.0127 | 21 | 10 | 43\% | 94\% |
| 21 | 10 | 634 | 0.0158 | 0.0250 | 0.0112 | 16 | 7 | 63\% | 140\% |
| 22 | 1 | 548 | 0.0018 | 0.0217 | 0.0092 | 12 | 5 | 8\% | 20\% |
| 23 | 3 | 424 | 0.0071 | 0.0170 | 0.0065 | 7 | 3 | 43\% | 109\% |
| 24 | 1 | 386 | 0.0026 | 0.0110 | 0.0030 | 4 | 1 | 25\% | 88\% |
| 25 | 0 | 323 | 0.0000 | 0.0032 | 0.0000 | 1 | 0 | 0\% | 0\% |
| Totals | 1,765 | 34,213 |  |  |  | 1,875 | 1,769 | 94\% | 100\% |

Gabriel Roeder Smith \& Company

## POLICE AND FIREFIGHTERS

## SERVICE BASED WITHDRAWAL EXPERIENCE

| Service | Actual <br> Withdrawal | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Withdrawal |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (3) } \\ *(5) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(3) *(6)$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed (2) / (8) |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 1 | 43 | 384 | 0.1120 | 0.1010 | 0.1010 | 39 | 39 | 111\% | 111\% |
| 2 | 37 | 685 | 0.0540 | 0.0537 | 0.0537 | 37 | 37 | 101\% | 101\% |
| 3 | 24 | 664 | 0.0361 | 0.0490 | 0.0490 | 33 | 33 | 74\% | 74\% |
| 4 | 22 | 625 | 0.0352 | 0.0444 | 0.0444 | 28 | 28 | 79\% | 79\% |
| 5 | 22 | 589 | 0.0374 | 0.0399 | 0.0399 | 23 | 23 | 94\% | 94\% |
| 6 | 26 | 548 | 0.0474 | 0.0355 | 0.0355 | 19 | 19 | 134\% | 134\% |
| 7 | 17 | 537 | 0.0317 | 0.0317 | 0.0317 | 17 | 17 | 100\% | 100\% |
| 8 | 16 | 508 | 0.0315 | 0.0282 | 0.0282 | 14 | 14 | 112\% | 112\% |
| 9 | 15 | 423 | 0.0355 | 0.0250 | 0.0250 | 11 | 11 | 142\% | 142\% |
| 10 | 10 | 442 | 0.0226 | 0.0220 | 0.0220 | 10 | 10 | 103\% | 103\% |
| 11 | 16 | 438 | 0.0365 | 0.0193 | 0.0193 | 8 | 8 | 189\% | 189\% |
| 12 | 17 | 457 | 0.0372 | 0.0169 | 0.0169 | 8 | 8 | 221\% | 221\% |
| 13 | 15 | 449 | 0.0334 | 0.0148 | 0.0148 | 7 | 7 | 226\% | 226\% |
| 14 | 3 | 439 | 0.0068 | 0.0126 | 0.0126 | 6 | 6 | 54\% | 54\% |
| 15+ | 7 | 447 | 0.0157 | 0.0110 | 0.0110 | 5 | 5 | 142\% | 142\% |
| Totals | 290 | 7,635 |  |  |  | 264 | 264 | 110\% | 110\% |

Salary Scale Assumption
General Employees

|  | Average Long <br> Service <br> Increase | CPI | Productivity |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Year | $3.09 \%$ | $3.25 \%$ | $-0.16 \%$ |
| 2001 | $5.42 \%$ | $1.07 \%$ | $4.36 \%$ |
| 2002 | $2.82 \%$ | $2.11 \%$ | $0.70 \%$ |
| 2003 | $3.38 \%$ | $3.27 \%$ | $0.12 \%$ |
| 2004 | $3.20 \%$ | $2.53 \%$ | $0.67 \%$ |
| 2005 | $4.92 \%$ | $4.32 \%$ | $0.60 \%$ |
| 2006 | $4.81 \%$ | $2.69 \%$ | $2.12 \%$ |
| 2007 | $3.88 \%$ | $5.02 \%$ | $-1.14 \%$ |
| 2008 | $3.54 \%$ | $-1.43 \%$ | $4.97 \%$ |
| 2009 | $1.52 \%$ | $1.05 \%$ | $0.46 \%$ |
| 2010 | $4.35 \%$ | $2.37 \%$ | $1.28 \%$ |
| Average | $4.00 \%$ | $2.75 \%$ | $1.25 \%$ |
| Proposed |  |  |  |


| Years of <br> Service | Average Pay <br> Increase | Less Actual <br> Inflation and <br> Productivity <br> Components | Actual Step- <br> Rate/Promotional <br> Component | Proposed Step- <br> Rate/Promotional <br> Component |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | $0.01 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $-3.64 \%$ | $4.00 \%$ |
| 2 | $3.74 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.09 \%$ | $3.00 \%$ |
| 3 | $6.76 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $3.11 \%$ | $2.75 \%$ |
| 4 | $6.54 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $2.89 \%$ | $2.50 \%$ |
| 5 | $5.90 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $2.25 \%$ | $2.25 \%$ |
| 6 | $5.97 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $2.32 \%$ | $2.00 \%$ |
| 7 | $5.34 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $1.69 \%$ | $1.25 \%$ |
| 8 | $4.28 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.63 \%$ | $0.75 \%$ |
| 9 | $4.19 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.54 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ |
| 10 | $4.67 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $1.01 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ |
| 11 | $4.30 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.65 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| 12 | $3.72 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.07 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| 13 | $3.71 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.06 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| 14 | $3.83 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.17 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| 15 | $4.16 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.51 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| $16+$ | $3.65 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |


| Years of <br> Service | Average Pay <br> Increase | Less Actual <br> Inflation and <br> Productivity <br> Components | Actual Step- <br> Rate/Promotional <br> Component | Proposed Step- <br> Rate/Promotional <br> Component |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | $0.01 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $-3.64 \%$ | $4.00 \%$ |
| 2 | $3.74 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.09 \%$ | $3.00 \%$ |
| 3 | $6.76 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $3.11 \%$ | $2.75 \%$ |
| 4 | $6.54 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $2.89 \%$ | $2.50 \%$ |
| 5 | $5.90 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $2.25 \%$ | $2.25 \%$ |
| 6 | $5.97 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $2.32 \%$ | $2.00 \%$ |
| 7 | $5.34 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $1.69 \%$ | $1.25 \%$ |
| 8 | $4.28 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.63 \%$ | $0.75 \%$ |
| 9 | $4.19 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $0.54 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ |
| 10 | $4.67 \%$ | $-3.65 \%$ | $1.01 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ |

Salary Scale Assumption

## Police and FireFighters

|  | Average Long <br> Service <br> Increase | CPI | Productivity |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| Year | $3.24 \%$ | $3.25 \%$ | $-0.01 \%$ |
| 2001 | $4.46 \%$ | $1.07 \%$ | $3.40 \%$ |
| 2002 | $3.81 \%$ | $2.11 \%$ | $1.70 \%$ |
| 2003 | $4.05 \%$ | $3.27 \%$ | $0.79 \%$ |
| 2004 | $0.74 \%$ | $2.53 \%$ | $-1.79 \%$ |
| 2005 | $8.87 \%$ | $4.32 \%$ | $4.55 \%$ |
| 2006 | $5.76 \%$ | $2.69 \%$ | $3.08 \%$ |
| 2007 | $2.79 \%$ | $5.02 \%$ | $-2.23 \%$ |
| 2008 | $3.24 \%$ | $-1.43 \%$ | $4.66 \%$ |
| 2009 | $3.52 \%$ | $1.05 \%$ | $4.66 \%$ |
| 2010 | $5.36 \%$ | $2.37 \%$ | $1.66 \%$ |
| Average | $4.25 \%$ | $2.75 \%$ | $1.50 \%$ |
| Proposed |  |  |  |


| Years of <br> Service | Average Pay <br> Increase | Less Actual <br> Inflation and <br> Productivity <br> Components | Actual Step- <br> Rate/Promotional <br> Component | Proposed Step- <br> Rate/Promotional <br> Component |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | $10.20 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $6.17 \%$ | $10.00 \%$ |
| 2 | $13.32 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $9.29 \%$ | $9.00 \%$ |
| 3 | $10.53 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $6.50 \%$ | $6.00 \%$ |
| 4 | $7.29 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $3.26 \%$ | $3.00 \%$ |
| 5 | $6.52 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $2.49 \%$ | $2.50 \%$ |
| 6 | $6.34 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $2.31 \%$ | $2.00 \%$ |
| 7 | $4.64 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $0.61 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ |
| 8 | $4.65 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $0.62 \%$ | $0.50 \%$ |
| 9 | $3.94 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $-0.09 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| 10 | $3.81 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $-0.22 \%$ | $0.25 \%$ |
| $11+$ | $4.03 \%$ | $-4.03 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ | $0.00 \%$ |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

MALE RETIREMENT EXPERIENCE - SERVICE BASED
For members who reach 30 years of service before age 58

| Service Year | Actual Retirement | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | Current (2) $/(7)$ | Proposed <br> (2) / (8) |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 30 | 23 | 90 | 0.256 | 0.300 | 0.300 | 27 | 27 | 85\% | 85\% |
| 31 | 25 | 77 | 0.325 | 0.250 | 0.300 | 19 | 23 | 130\% | 109\% |
| 32 | 14 | 63 | 0.222 | 0.150 | 0.250 | 9 | 16 | 148\% | 88\% |
| 33 | 12 | 50 | 0.240 | 0.150 | 0.250 | 8 | 13 | 160\% | 92\% |
| 34 | 8 | 37 | 0.216 | 0.150 | 0.250 | 6 | 9 | 144\% | 89\% |
| 35 | 7 | 35 | 0.200 | 0.250 | 0.250 | 9 | 9 | 80\% | 78\% |
| 36 | 9 | 24 | 0.375 | 0.250 | 0.250 | 6 | 6 | 150\% | 150\% |
| 37 | 4 | 19 | 0.211 | 0.250 | 0.250 | 5 | 5 | 84\% | 80\% |
| 38 | 5 | 15 | 0.333 | 0.250 | 0.350 | 4 | 5 | 133\% | 100\% |
| 39 | 4 | 7 | 0.571 | 0.250 | 0.500 | 2 | 4 | 229\% | 100\% |
| 40 | 1 | 2 | 0.500 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 2 | 2 | 50\% | 50\% |
| 41 | - | 1 | 0.000 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 42 | 1 | 1 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1 | 1 | 100\% | 100\% |
| 43 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 44 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 45 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 46 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 47 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 48 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 49 | 1 | 3 | 0.333 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 3 | 3 | 33\% | 33\% |
| Other | - | - | N/A | 0.000 | 0.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Total | 114 | 424 | 0.269 |  |  | 101 | 124 | 113\% | 92\% |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

FEMALE RETIREMENT EXPERIENCE - SERVICE BASED
For members who reach 30 years of service before age 58

| $\begin{gathered} \text { Service } \\ \text { Year } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Actual Retirement | $\underline{\text { Total Count }}$ | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | Current (2) / (7) | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 30 | 13 | 40 | 0.325 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 8 | 12 | 163\% | 108\% |
| 31 | 9 | 35 | 0.257 | 0.150 | 0.250 | 5 | 9 | 171\% | 100\% |
| 32 | 2 | 27 | 0.074 | 0.075 | 0.100 | 2 | 3 | 99\% | 67\% |
| 33 | 3 | 30 | 0.100 | 0.075 | 0.100 | 2 | 3 | 133\% | 100\% |
| 34 | 2 | 28 | 0.071 | 0.075 | 0.100 | 2 | 3 | 95\% | 67\% |
| 35 | 3 | 25 | 0.120 | 0.150 | 0.150 | 4 | 4 | 80\% | 75\% |
| 36 | 2 | 19 | 0.105 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 4 | 4 | 53\% | 50\% |
| 37 | 5 | 16 | 0.313 | 0.200 | 0.250 | 3 | 4 | 156\% | 125\% |
| 38 | 4 | 15 | 0.267 | 0.150 | 0.250 | 2 | 4 | 178\% | 100\% |
| 39 | 1 | 7 | 0.143 | 0.150 | 0.250 | 1 | 2 | 95\% | 50\% |
| 40 | 1 | 4 | 0.250 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 4 | 4 | 25\% | 25\% |
| 41 | - | 1 | 0.000 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 42 | - | 1 | 0.000 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 43 | - | 1 | 0.000 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 1 | 1 | 0\% | 0\% |
| 44 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 45 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 46 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 47 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 48 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| 49 | - | - | N/A | 1.000 | 1.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Other | - | - | N/A | 0.000 | 0.000 | - | - | N/A | N/A |
| Total | 45 | 249 | 0.181 |  |  | 41 | 55 | 111\% | 82\% |

## POLICE \& FIRE UNITS WITH THE OPTIONAL 20-YEAR RETIREMENT RETIREMENT EXPERIENCE - SERVICE BASED

For members who reach 20 years of service

| Service Year | Actual Retirement | $\underline{\text { Total Count }}$ | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 20 | 18 | 224 | 0.080 | 0.150 | 0.120 | 34 | 27 | 54\% | 67\% |
| 21 | 31 | 192 | 0.161 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 19 | 19 | 161\% | 161\% |
| 22 | 12 | 135 | 0.089 | 0.050 | 0.100 | 7 | 14 | 178\% | 89\% |
| 23 | 7 | 113 | 0.062 | 0.050 | 0.100 | 6 | 11 | 124\% | 62\% |
| 24 | 12 | 102 | 0.118 | 0.050 | 0.120 | 5 | 12 | 235\% | 98\% |
| 25 | 12 | 71 | 0.169 | 0.100 | 0.140 | 7 | 10 | 169\% | 121\% |
| 26 | 11 | 78 | 0.141 | 0.120 | 0.160 | 9 | 12 | 118\% | 88\% |
| 27 | 9 | 59 | 0.153 | 0.140 | 0.180 | 8 | 11 | 109\% | 85\% |
| 28 | 5 | 51 | 0.098 | 0.160 | 0.200 | 8 | 10 | 61\% | 49\% |
| 29 | 9 | 34 | 0.265 | 0.180 | 0.200 | 6 | 7 | 147\% | 132\% |
| 30 or more | 27 | 84 | 0.321 | 0.350 | 0.350 | 29 | 29 | 92\% | 92\% |
| Total | 153 | 1,143 | 0.134 |  |  | 139 | 163 | 110\% | 94\% |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

MALE RETIREMENT EXPERIENCE - AGE BASED
For members who reach age 58 before 30 years of service

| Age | Actual Retirement | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (3) } \\ \quad *(5) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(3) *(6)$ | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (2) } \\ \quad /(7) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed <br> (2) / (8) |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 58 | 26 | 285 | 0.091 | 0.150 | 0.120 | 43 | 34 | 60\% | 76\% |
| 59 | 29 | 237 | 0.122 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 24 | 24 | 121\% | 121\% |
| 60 | 14 | 216 | 0.065 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 22 | 22 | 64\% | 64\% |
| 61 | 16 | 214 | 0.075 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 21 | 21 | 76\% | 76\% |
| 62 | 50 | 201 | 0.249 | 0.300 | 0.300 | 60 | 60 | 83\% | 83\% |
| 63 | 29 | 161 | 0.180 | 0.250 | 0.200 | 40 | 32 | 73\% | 91\% |
| 64 | 23 | 122 | 0.189 | 0.250 | 0.200 | 31 | 24 | 74\% | 96\% |
| 65 | 20 | 110 | 0.182 | 0.250 | 0.200 | 28 | 22 | 71\% | 91\% |
| 66 | 22 | 100 | 0.220 | 0.300 | 0.250 | 30 | 25 | 73\% | 88\% |
| 67 | 23 | 87 | 0.264 | 0.300 | 0.250 | 26 | 22 | 88\% | 105\% |
| 68 | 17 | 69 | 0.246 | 0.300 | 0.250 | 21 | 17 | 81\% | 100\% |
| 69 | 17 | 56 | 0.304 | 0.300 | 0.300 | 17 | 17 | 100\% | 100\% |
| 70 | 13 | 37 | 0.351 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 7 | 11 | 186\% | 118\% |
| 71 | 6 | 27 | 0.222 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 5 | 8 | 120\% | 75\% |
| 72 | 10 | 23 | 0.435 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 5 | 7 | 200\% | 143\% |
| 73 | 2 | 16 | 0.125 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 3 | 5 | 67\% | 40\% |
| 74 | 1 | 13 | 0.077 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 3 | 4 | 33\% | 25\% |
| Subtotal | 318 | 1,974 | 0.161 |  |  | 386 | 355 | 82\% | 90\% |
| 75 \& Over | 19 | 110 | 0.173 | 0.200 | 0.300 | 110 | 110 | 17\% | 17\% |
| Total | 337 | 2,084 | 0.162 |  |  | 496 | 465 | 68\% | 72\% |

## GENERAL EMPLOYEES

## FEMALE RETIREMENT EXPERIENCE - AGE BASED

For members who reach age 58 before 30 years of service

| Age | Actual Retirement | Total Count | Actual Rate | Assumed Rate |  | Expected Retirement |  | Actual/Expected |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | Current | Proposed | $\begin{gathered} \hline \text { Current (3) } \\ \quad *(5) \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | Proposed $(3) *(6)$ | Current (2) /(7) | Proposed $(2) /(8)$ |
| (1) | (2) | (3) | (4) | (5) | (6) | (7) | (8) | (9) | (10) |
| 58 | 53 | 579 | 0.092 | 0.150 | 0.120 | 87 | 69 | 61\% | 77\% |
| 59 | 54 | 518 | 0.104 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 52 | 52 | 104\% | 104\% |
| 60 | 38 | 472 | 0.081 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 47 | 47 | 81\% | 81\% |
| 61 | 47 | 419 | 0.112 | 0.100 | 0.100 | 42 | 42 | 112\% | 112\% |
| 62 | 74 | 398 | 0.186 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 80 | 80 | 93\% | 93\% |
| 63 | 52 | 308 | 0.169 | 0.150 | 0.150 | 46 | 46 | 113\% | 113\% |
| 64 | 42 | 254 | 0.165 | 0.150 | 0.150 | 38 | 38 | 111\% | 111\% |
| 65 | 37 | 218 | 0.170 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 44 | 44 | 84\% | 84\% |
| 66 | 58 | 178 | 0.326 | 0.200 | 0.250 | 36 | 45 | 161\% | 129\% |
| 67 | 36 | 138 | 0.261 | 0.200 | 0.250 | 28 | 35 | 129\% | 103\% |
| 68 | 27 | 108 | 0.250 | 0.200 | 0.250 | 22 | 27 | 123\% | 100\% |
| 69 | 17 | 79 | 0.215 | 0.200 | 0.250 | 16 | 20 | 106\% | 85\% |
| 70 | 18 | 62 | 0.290 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 12 | 12 | 150\% | 150\% |
| 71 | 8 | 43 | 0.186 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 9 | 9 | 89\% | 89\% |
| 72 | 4 | 34 | 0.118 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 7 | 7 | 57\% | 57\% |
| 73 | 4 | 31 | 0.129 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 6 | 6 | 67\% | 67\% |
| 74 | 7 | 31 | 0.226 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 6 | 6 | 117\% | 117\% |
| Subtotal | 576 | 3,870 | 0.149 |  |  | 578 | 585 | 100\% | 98\% |
| 75 \& Over | 29 | 103 | 0.282 | 0.200 | 0.200 | 103 | 103 | 28\% | 28\% |
| Total | 605 | 3,973 | 0.152 |  |  | 681 | 688 | 89\% | 88\% |

